DRAFT MINUTES FOR August 18th & 19th, 2010 MEETING OF GOVERNING BOARD (ICOC)

Location:

Paul Brest Hall Munger Complex Stanford University Stanford, CA 94305 Salk Institute 10010 N. Torrey Pines Rd., La Jolla, CA 92037

City of Hope 1500 E. Duarte Road Duarte, California 91010

	August 18th, 2010	August 19 th , 2010
Robert Birgeneau/Robert Price	PRESENT	PRESENT
David Brenner	PRESENT	PRESENT
William Brody/Kim Witmer	PRESENT	PRESENT
Susan V. Bryant	PRESENT	PRESENT
Marcy Feit	PRESENT	PRESENT
Michael A. Friedman	PRESENT	PRESENT
Leeza Gibbons	ABSENT	ABSENT
Michael Goldberg	PRESENT	PRESENT
Sam Hawgood	PRESENT	PRESENT
Robert Klein	PRESENT	PRESENT
Sherry Lansing	PRESENT	PRESENT
Ted W. Love	PRESENT	PRESENT
Ed Penhoet	PRESENT	PRESENT
Philip A. Pizzo	PRESENT	PRESENT
Claire Pomeroy	PRESENT	PRESENT
Francisco J. Prieto	PRESENT	PRESENT
Carmen Puliafito/Elizabeth Fini	ABSENT	PRESENT
Robert Quint	PRESENT	PRESENT
John C. Reed	ABSENT	ABSENT
Duane Roth	PRESENT	PRESENT
Joan Samuelson	PRESENT	PRESENT
David Serrano Sewell	PRESENT	ABSENT
Jeff Sheehy	PRESENT	PRESENT
Jonathan Shestack	ABSENT	ABSENT
Oswald Stewart	PRESENT	PRESENT
Art Torres	PRESENT	PRESENT
Eugene Washington/James Economou	PRESENT	PRESENT

CLOSED SESSION

Agenda Item #4

Discussion of Personnel [Evaluation of President] (Government Code section 11126, subdivision (a); Health & Safety Code section 125290.30(d) (3) (D)). Public report of any action taken, if necessary, during closed session.

- Closed Session Held
- Nothing to Report Back

REPORTS

Agenda Item #5 Chairman's Report.

• Report given by Bob Klein

Agenda Item # 6 President's Report.

Report given by Alan Trounson

ACTION ITEMS

Agenda Item # 7 Consideration of minutes from past Board meetings.

- APRIL 2010 ICOC MINUTES
- JUNE 2010 ICOC MINUTES

Motion:

- Motion made by Claire Pomeroy to approve minutes from April and June 2010 Board Meetings
- Motion seconded by Sherry Lansing

Vote:

- The ICOC by group voice vote APPROVED the minutes from the April and June 2010 Board Meetings
- With Kim Witmer and Michael Friedman by voting YES over the phone by roll call vote

Agenda Item #8 Consideration of implementation of reduction to Facilities Cost Part (b) Reimbursement for CIRM Major Facilities Grantees.

- Presentation given by John Robson
- MEMO REGARDING FACILITIES PART B REIMBURSEMENT REDUCTION

NO ACTION TAKEN ON THIS ITEM

Agenda Item #9 Consideration of proposed new scientific members for Grants Working Group.

Motion:

- Motion made by Sherry Lansing to approve new scientific members for the Grants Working Group
- Motion seconded by Duane Roth

Vote:

- The ICOC by group voice vote APPROVED the new scientific members to the Grants Working Group
- With William Brody and Michael Friedman by voting YES over the phone by roll call vote

Agenda Item #10. Consideration of concept proposal for Disease Teams II RFA.

Presentation given by Bettina Steffan

Motion:

- Motion made by Ed Penhoet to Approve the Disease Team II concept plan but modify with the provision to permit up to approximately 30 planning grant awards and up to approximately 12 awards, and incorporate in the communications regarding RFA that CIRM is actively seeking industry participation.
- Motion seconded by David Brenner

Vote:

- The ICOC by group voice vote APPROVED the Disease Teams II RFA with the amendments.
- With William Brody and Michael Friedman by voting YES over the phone by roll call vote

Agenda Item #11. Referral from Science Subcommittee: Consideration of <u>staff proposal regarding policy for use</u> of unused Disease Research Team Award funds for Clinical Trials.

Presentation given by Pat Olson

Motion:

- Motion made by Ted Love to endorse staff policy regarding unused Disease Team funds, but REQUIRE staff
 to notify the Board when request is made and considered
- Motion seconded by Ed Penhoet

Vote:

• The ICOC by roll call vote PASSED the motion

Vote Talley:

• 8 YES votes; 0 No Votes; 1 Abstention; 15 Conflicts

Agenda Item #12 Referral from Science Subcommittee: Consideration of proposal commissioning IOM report on CIRM.

Presentation given by Jeff Sheehy

Motion:

- Motion made by Jeff Sheehy to APPROVE IOM study, but expand scope to include analysis of output of awarded grants, including their economic impact, and direct staff to use donor funds to pay, with 20% variation in contract amount, and request approval by November 2012.
- Motion seconded by Art Torres

Vote:

The ICOC by roll call vote PASSED the Motion

Vote Talley:

• 18 YES votes; 2 NO Votes; 4 ABSTENTIONS

Agenda #13 Referral from Governance Subcommittee: Consideration of amendments to Contracts Policy.

• Presentation given by Ian Sweedler

Motion:

- Motion made by Duane Roth to approve Contract Policy Amendments
- Motion seconded by Art Torres

Vote:

The ICOC by group voice vote PASSED the motion

Agenda Item #14 Referral from Governance Subcommittee: Consideration of <u>amendments to ICOC Bylaws.</u> MEMO REGARDING AMENDMENTS TO ICOC BYLAWS

• Presentation given by James Harrison

Motion:

- Motion made by Michael Goldberg to Approve Amendment to Board Bylaws Regarding Patient Advocate Compensation for Service on the Working Groups
- Motion seconded by Duane Roth

Vote:

- The ICOC by group voice vote PASSED the motion
- 14 YES votes: 7 ABSTENTIONS

Motion:

- Motion made by David Serrano Sewell Approve Amendments to Bylaws Relating to Open Roll Voting, Minimum Number of Required Meetings for Governance and Legislative Subcommittees, and Procedure for Conduct of the Election for Chair and Vice Chair
- Motion seconded by Clair Pomeroy

Vote:

• The ICOC by group voice vote PASSED the motion

Agenda Item #15 Consideration of process and procedures for election of ICOC Chair and Vice-Chair.

Presentation given by James Harrison

Motion:

- Motion made by Phil Pizzo Approve Procedures for Consideration of Chair and Vice Chair, but Make Clear that Public may participate in Meeting at which Nominee Presentations are Made, including Permitting Public to Pose Questions
- Motion seconded by Bob Klein

Vote:

• The ICOC by group voice vote passed the motion

Agenda Item # 16 Consideration of appointment of Chair and Vice-Chair of Evaluation Subcommittee.

Motion:

- Motion made by Art Torres to appoint Francisco Prieto and Ted Love as Chair and Vice Chair, Respectively, of the Evaluation Subcommittee
- Motion seconded by Sherry Lansing

Vote:

• The ICOC by group voice vote PASSED the motion

DISCUSSION ITEMS

Agenda Item #17. Public comment. The Committee will accept public testimony on any matter under its jurisdiction that is not on the agenda, but the Committee cannot act on any such matter at this meeting

No Public Comments made at this meeting

Proposed Agenda Item

Motion:

- Motion made by Sherry Lansing to consider additional agenda item
- Motion seconded by Michael Goldberg

Vote:

- The ICOC by group voice vote approved the motion
- With Kim Witmer and Michael Freidman voting yes by roll call vote over the phone

Agenda Item #1 Consideration of Assembly Bill 52 (Portantino), California Umbilical Cord Blood Collection Program.Committee Analysis, 08/16/10

• Presentation given by Art Torres

Motion:

- Motion made by Bob Klein to endorse the Bill
- Motion seconded by Claire Pomeroy

Vote:

The ICOC by voice vote APPROVED the motion

Independent Citizens Oversight Committee					
Oversignt Committee	8/18/10				
			Vote On:		
		Motion 1	Motion 2		
		Motion Maker:	Motion Maker:		
		Lansing	Klein		
		Seconded:	Seconded:		
		Goldberg	Pomeroy		
Members	Attendance	Description: Consider Additional Agenda Item Regarding AB 52			
Robert Price for Birgeneau	Р	Υ	Υ		
Floyd Bloom	А				
David Brenner	Р	Y	Y		
William Brody/Kim Witmer by Phone	Р	Υ	Y		
Susan Bryant	Р	Y	Y		
Marcy Feit	Р	Y	Y		
Michael Friedman <i>By Phone</i>	Р	Y	Y		
Leeza Gibbons	Α				
Michael Goldberg	Р	Y	Y		
Sam Hawgood	Р	Υ	Y		
Bob Klein	Р	Υ	Y		
Sherry Lansing	Р	Y	Υ		
Ted Love	Α				
Shlomo Melmed	Α				
Ed Penhoet	Р	Y	Y		
Phil Pizzo	Р	Y	Y		
Claire Pomeroy	Р	Y	Y		
Francisco Prieto	Р	Y	Y		
Elizabeth Fini <i>for Puliafito</i>	Α				
Robert Quint	Α				
John Reed	Α				
Duane Roth	Р	Y	Y		
Joan Samuelson	P -	Y	Y		
David Serrano Sewell	P	Y	Y		
Jeff Sheehy	P	Υ	Y		
Jon Shestack	A	27			
Oswald Steward	P	Y	Y		
Art Torres James Economou for Washington	P	Y	Y		
James Economou <i>for washington</i>	P	Y 24 0/5ics \/sts\	Y 24 () (size) (ste)		
	P : 21	Y: 21 (Voice Vote)	Y: 21 (Voice Vote)		
	A: 8	N: 0	N: 0		
Total		A : 0	A : 0		
		C: 0	C: 0		
		PASS	PASS		

Independent Citizens Oversight Committee		
	Motion 3 Motion Maker: Pomeroy Seconded:	Motion 4 Motion Maker: Torres Seconded:
Members	Lansing Description: Approve Minutes for April and June 2010 Board Meetings	Lansing Description: Appoint Francisco Prieto and Ted Love as Chair and Vice Chair, Respectively, of the Evaluation Subcommittee
Debort Price for Pirgenegu	Υ	Υ
Robert Price for Birgeneau Floyd Bloom	T	T
David Brenner	Υ	Υ
William Brody/Kim Witmer by Phone	Y	Y
Susan Bryant	Y	Y
Marcy Feit	Y	Y
Michael Friedman <i>By Phone</i>	Y	Y
Leeza Gibbons		1
Michael Goldberg	Y	Y
Sam Hawgood	Y	Y
Bob Klein	Y	Y
Sherry Lansing	Y	Y
Ted Love		
Shlomo Melmed		
Ed Penhoet	Y	Y
Phil Pizzo	Y	Y
Claire Pomeroy	Y	Y
Francisco Prieto	Y	A
Elizabeth Fini <i>for Puliafito</i>		
Robert Quint		
John Reed		
Duane Roth	Υ	Y
Joan Samuelson	Y	Y
David Serrano Sewell	Y	Y
Jeff Sheehy	Y	Y
Jon Shestack		
Oswald Steward	Y	Y
Art Torres	Y	Y
James Economou for Washington	Y	Y
	Y: 21 (Voice Vote)	Y: 21 (Voice Vote)
	N : 0	N : 0
Total	A : 0	A : 0
	C : 0	C: 0
	PASS	PASS
	.,,,,,,	

Independent Citizens	
Oversight Committee	
	8/18/10
	Vote On:
	Motion 5
	Motion Maker:
	Serrano Sewell
	Seconded: Pomeroy
	Forneroy
Members	
	Description:
	Approve Amendments to Bylaws Relating to Open Roll Voting, Minimum
	Number of Required Meetings for Governance and Legislative
	Subcommittees, and Procedure for Conduct of the Election for Chair and
	Vice Chair
Robert Price for Birgeneau	Y
Floyd Bloom	
David Brenner	Υ
William Brody/Kim Witmer by Phone	Υ
Susan Bryant	Υ
Marcy Feit	Υ
Michael Friedman By Phone	Υ
Leeza Gibbons	
Michael Goldberg	Υ
Sam Hawgood	Υ
Bob Klein	Υ
Sherry Lansing	Υ
Ted Love	
Shlomo Melmed	
Ed Penhoet	Υ
Phil Pizzo	Υ
Claire Pomeroy	Υ
Francisco Prieto	Υ
Elizabeth Fini for Puliafito	
Robert Quint	
John Reed	
Duane Roth	Υ
Joan Samuelson	Y
David Serrano Sewell	Y
Jeff Sheehy	Y
Jon Shestack	·
Oswald Steward	Y
Art Torres	Y
James Economou for Washington	Ϋ́Υ
cames Economica for washington	
	Y: 21 (Voice Vote)
	N: 0
Total	A: 0
	C : 0
	PASS

Independent Citizens		
Oversight Committee	8/18/10	
	Vote On:	
	Motion 6	
	Motion Maker:	
	Goldberg	
	Seconded:	
	Roth	
Members	Description: Approve Amendment to Board Bylaws Regarding Patient Advocate Compensation for Service on the Working Groups	Attendance
Robert Price for Birgeneau	Υ	Р
Floyd Bloom		A
David Brenner	Υ	P
Nilliam Brody/Kim Witmer by Phone	Υ	Р
Susan Bryant	Y	Р
Marcy Feit	A	P (11:45 A.M.)
Aichael Friedman By Phone	Υ	P (11:45 A.M.)
eeza Gibbons		A
lichael Goldberg	Y	P
am Hawgood	Y	P (11:45 A.M.)
ob Klein	Y	P
Sherry Lansing Fied Love	A	P P
chlomo Melmed		A
Ed Penhoet	Y	P
Phil Pizzo	Y	P
laire Pomeroy	Y	P
rancisco Prieto	A	P
lizabeth Fini <i>for Puliafito</i>	,	P
Robert Quint		P
ohn Reed		A
Duane Roth	Υ	P
oan Samuelson	A	P
Pavid Serrano Sewell	A	P
eff Sheehy	A	Р
on Shestack		Α
swald Steward	A	Р
urt Torres	Y	Р
F ()4/ 1: /	Υ	Р
	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	P : 24
	N : 0	P : 24 A : 5
Total	N: 0 A: 7	
Total	N : 0	

Independent Citizens Oversight Committee		
Oversight Committee	8/19/10	8/'
	Vote On:	Voi
	Motion 7	Motion 8
	Motion Maker:	Motion Maker:
	Roth	Pizzo
	Seconded:	Seconded:
	Torres	Klein
Members	Description: Approve Contract Policy Amendments	Description: Approve Procedures for Consideration of Chair and Vice Chair, but Make Clear that Public may Participate in Meeting at which Nominee Presentations are Made, including Permitting Public to Pose Questions
Robert Price for Birgeneau	Υ	Y
Floyd Bloom		
David Brenner	Y	Y
William Brody/Kim Witmer by Phone	Y	Y
Susan Bryant	Y	Y
Marcy Feit		
Michael Friedman By Phone		
Leeza Gibbons		
Michael Goldberg	Y	Y
Sam Hawgood		
Bob Klein	Υ	Y
Sherry Lansing	Υ	Y
Ted Love	Υ	Y
Shlomo Melmed		
Ed Penhoet	Υ	Y
Phil Pizzo	Υ	Y
Claire Pomeroy	Υ	Y
Francisco Prieto	Υ	Y
Elizabeth Fini for Puliafito	Y	Y
Robert Quint	Υ	Υ
John Reed		V
Duane Roth	Y	Y
Joan Samuelson	Y	Y
David Serrano Sewell	Y Y	Y Y
Jeff Sheehy	Y	Y
Jon Shestack	Y	Y
Oswald Steward Art Torres	Ϋ́	Y
James Economou for Washington	Y	Y
cames Economica for Washington	Y: 21 (Voice Vote)	Y: 21 (Voice Vote)
	N: 0	N: 0
Total		
Iotal	A: 0	A: 0
	C: 0	C: 0
	PASS	PASS

Independent Citizens Oversight Committee			
Oversight Committee	19/10		
	e On:		
	Motion 9	Motion 10	
	Motion Maker:	Motion Maker:	
	Penhoet Seconded:	Lansing Seconded:	
	Brenner	Roth	
Members	Description: Approve Disease Team II Concept Plan, but Modify to Permit up to Approximately 30 Planning Grant Awards and up to Approximately 12 Awards, and Incorporate in the Communications Regarding RFA that CIRM is Actively Seeking Industry	Description: Approve New Scientific Members of GWG	
Robert Price for Birgeneau	Υ	Y	
Floyd Bloom			
David Brenner	Y	Y	
William Brody/Kim Witmer by Phone	Y	Y	
Susan Bryant	Y	Y	
Marcy Feit	Y	Y	
Michael Friedman <i>By Phone</i>	Y	Y	
Leeza Gibbons			
Michael Goldberg	Y	Y	
Sam Hawgood	Y	Y	
Bob Klein	Y	Y	
Sherry Lansing	Y	Y	
Ted Love	Y	Y	
Shlomo Melmed			
Ed Penhoet	Y	Y	
Phil Pizzo	Υ	Y	
Claire Pomeroy	Υ	Υ	
Francisco Prieto	Y	Y	
Elizabeth Fini for Puliafito	Y	Y	
Robert Quint	Y	Y	
John Reed			
Duane Roth	Y	Y	
Joan Samuelson	Y	Y	
David Serrano Sewell	Y	Y	
Jeff Sheehy	Y	Y	
Jon Shestack			
Oswald Steward	Y	Y	
Art Torres	Y	Y	
James Economou for Washington	Υ	Y	
	Y: 24 (Voice Vote)	Y: 24 (Voice Vote)	
	N : 0	N : 0	
Total	A : 0	A : 0	
	C : 0	C : 0	
	PASS	PASS	

Independent Citizens		
Oversight Committee		
	8/19/10	
		Vote On:
	Motion 11	Motion 12
	Motion Maker:	Motion Maker:
	Love Seconded:	Sheehy Seconded:
	Penhoet	Torres
Members	Description: Endorse Staff Policy regarding unused Disease Team funds, but Require Staff to Notify Board when Request is Made and Considered	Description: Approve IOM Study, but Expand Scope to Include Analysis of Output of Awarded Grants, including their Economic Impact, and Direct Staff to use Donor Funds to Pay, with 20% Variation in Contract Amount, and Request CompletionI by November 2012
Robert Price for Birgeneau	Υ	N
Floyd Bloom	С	
David Brenner	С	A
William Brody/Kim Witmer by Phone	С	Y
Susan Bryant	Υ	Υ
Marcy Feit	С	Y
Michael Friedman By Phone	С	Y
Leeza Gibbons		
Michael Goldberg	С	Y
Sam Hawgood	С	А
Bob Klein	Y	Y
Sherry Lansing	С	Υ
Ted Love	Υ	Υ
Shlomo Melmed		
Ed Penhoet	Υ	A
Phil Pizzo	С	A
Claire Pomeroy	С	Υ
Francisco Prieto	С	Υ
Elizabeth Fini for Puliafito	С	Υ
Robert Quint	Υ	Υ
John Reed		
Duane Roth	Υ	N
Joan Samuelson		Y
David Serrano Sewell	Α	Υ
Jeff Sheehy	С	Υ
Jon Shestack		
Oswald Steward	С	Υ
Art Torres	Y	Y
James Economou for Washington	С	Υ
	Y: 8	Y: 18 (Voice Vote)
	N : 0	N: 2
Total	A : 1	A: 4
	C : 15	C : 0
	PASS	PASS